

## Spring 2013 Discipline Rubric Projects Process Summary

After completing a rubric for core learning outcome assessment within a discipline, project participants were asked to submit responses to the following questions:

### 1. Describe the methods your team used to collaborate and develop the rubric.

CLO	Faculty Response	Discipline
Think	Anne McGrail shared with fellow online literature faculty Eileen Thompson, Amy Beasley and Jennifer Von Ammon the rubric she uses to assess critical reading and writing responses in her ONLINE English 104, 105, 106—the Introduction to Literature Series. The group tinkered with that rubric and then mapped it onto the CLOs from the college’s THINK dimension/outcome, with color-coding to visually aid with the conceptual mapping. The group reached consensus on the language and we are submitting it above. We include a “failing” column, since for our courses it’s important to communicate the rationale behind low grades, but this isn’t perhaps necessary for the ATeam.	English 104,105,106
Think & Apply	After organizing into a group of 5 (6) faculty involved in teaching and creation of the WST program, and studying the process of the creation of the LCC CLOs, we had our first meeting of the minds on 4/26, our “brainstorming” session. Notes were taken and shared with the group. Our next meeting is 5/7/13.	Watershed Science
Think, Engage, & Apply	Our team reviewed the standards for Associate Degrees identified by The Council for Standards in Human Service Education and looked at the competencies required for Human Service Professional Certification. From this list, we identified the classes primarily responsible for teaching each of these competencies. We then selected competencies that we wanted to build a critical thinking rubric for that would clarify our own expectations, and exemplify various levels of critical thinking for our students. We met three times for several hours to plan out our effort and review each individual’s work.	Human Services
Engage	The team met initially to interpret the outcome sub-descriptors and map out traits and characteristics for each. Subsequently, the team collaborated (via Dropbox) in drafting an initial fully fleshed out rubric, which was then revised over a multi-week period culminating in the final draft.	Literature
Create	We used google docs and met weekly to discuss and form our rubric.	Art

Communicate	<p>Our two team members kicked off the project by meeting face to face to discuss how to proceed. We began by reviewing and inserting into the rubric shell the <i>Communicate Effectively</i> dimensions approved by the college, and we had on hand the previous iteration of the college's <i>Communicate Effectively</i> rubric.</p> <p>Our next step was to split our Speech and Communication Studies courses into two groups: the performance group and the communication theory group. Our concern was that we develop a rubric not particular to oral communication and that would apply vocabulary of the discipline across theory and application. We scoured the course objectives and topics to align terminology and central objectives with the articulated dimensions expressed by the college. We were fortunate to have access to the recently developed <i>Create Ideas and Solutions</i> rubric, which bolstered confidence in our rubric's style and approach.</p> <p>Our method was to exchange email document versions, color-coded for each person's content. We each tweaked and edited as the document flowed back and forth. Four weeks into the process we met again face to face to have an extended session where we could discuss our concerns about how we were expressing one concept or another, to brainstorm forms of expression, to hammer out diction, and improve clarity. This was a productive turning point in pulling together a coherent rubric. For the final touches we have exchanged document versions once again, now all in black for minor revisions.</p>	Speech and Communications
Communicate	<p>Andy, Nina and Ann met initially to choose a CLO and decide the level of content. A brief joint brainstorming of ideas was followed by several email exchanges. Andy decided he could not commit to the project.</p> <p>Nina developed the initial framework of the rubric and examples and Ann revised them. They discussed each change and re-arrangement of key concepts. Ann aligned Math 20 course objectives with the CLO's.</p>	Math
Apply	<p>We utilized in-person meetings and the use of a shared Google document as primary tools for communication. In order to align the Apply rubric with its categories, we referenced the Clinical Performance Instrument (CPI: a measure of a PTA students progress during clinical affiliations using a series of skills with individual rating anchors), the "APTA Normative Model for PTA Education", LEAP rubrics, the educational content of PTA instruction, and reflected on our experience as faculty and instructors to differentiate between levels of learning cross referenced with CPI. Lastly, we found it useful to identify a sequence of courses in our two year program and correlate them with each category of the rubric to help frame a progression in student learning.</p>	Physical Therapist Assistant

## 2. How effective was the project design and project support for facilitating development of a meaningful CLO rubric for your discipline?

CLO	Faculty Response	Discipline
Think	It was pretty low-maintenance once we could find the time to all review our materials. The “THINK” CLO is very amenable to this rubric since this introduction to literature course is all about critical thinking, reading and writing. We made very few changes to our rubric to accommodate the CLO rubric.	English 104,105,106
Think & Apply	It was effective; materials were laid out sufficiently well to give us a good start, once time was available for us to begin work. We appreciate the time extension as it helped us out a great deal. Team members participated in three efficient group meetings and our group exchanged many emails and document drafts. Working group meetings were very interactive and always attended by a majority of team members. All members of the team participated well.	Watershed Science
Think, Engage, & Apply	This was a good project design. It was quite helpful to agree to make a time limited commitment to this project, and to make some forward movement in this area. Had we been told to overhaul our whole curriculum, we would not have applied for this project. This was a small piece to take on and seemed “do-able” given so many other constant demands. It also encouraged part time faculty to be involved. The support available was more than adequate	Human Services
Engage	Satisfactory - overall. More clarity and detail about intended purpose and target audience, as well as intended discipline-specific usage, would have been helpful.	Literature
Create	That is hard to answer with the experience I had had. We did change the categories and subheadings, as you can see. (Even though I helped develop them)	Art
Communicate	Having both worked with the Assessment Team over many years, we were excited to embark on this new effort to develop a discipline-adapted rubric aligned with the college mission and strategic direction of a liberal education approach to learning, a direction we both embrace. We had worked with previous college critical thinking and communicate effectively rubrics, and we were aware of AAC&U value rubrics, the DQP, and other schools’ CLO models. Though we did not tap those directly, there is a good chance they influenced our work in the sense of forming our thinking over time. We enthusiastically endorse this project’s design, which provided the structure of the college vision (through the articulated CLO dimensions) and allowed creative and pedagogical freedom to adapt assessment of our chosen CLO to our field of study. We find this strategy coherent, stimulating, and liberating, aptly reflecting the Assessment Team’s charter for faculty-driven assessment of student learning.	Speech and Communications
Communicate	The project design, and supporting materials, gave us both clear guidelines and the freedom to adapt them to math teaching and learning. The only conflict we encountered was with the course objectives are written as demonstrative skills, while the CLO’s, as applied to math content read more as performance objectives. We tried to address this with a comparison to the new Common Core State Standards, which have standards to address both.	Math

Apply	Focusing on one CLO allowed our team to be specific and intentional in developing criteria. The profession of physical therapy contains a diverse range of skills and looking at one specific element made it easier to develop a tool for this CLO. In the future, it would be helpful to get examples from other programs and departments to improve our effectiveness in creating the best possible rubric.	Physical Therapist Assistant
-------	--	------------------------------

### 3. Did your involvement with this project inform you about the effectiveness of assessment within your discipline?

CLO	Faculty Response	Discipline
Think	It is a beginning. Perhaps next year we can work collectively to apply the rubric and see how it works across our common courses.	English 104,105,106
Think & Apply	We have only a beginning of an understanding about how this process will inform our assessment. The rubric development will assist us as we move forward identifying assessment goals for our WST 230 and 234 courses in particular, as well as through Cooperative Education, a requirement in this CTE program, and these are where Technical Skills and Abilities will be assessed. In addition, this will better inform our prerequisite courses, including AAOT courses such as ENVS 181 and 183, about our overall program expectations and they will enrich the activities and assessments conducted in those classes, which include programs in Biology, Environmental Science, Water Conservation, and GIS. We will communicate our final rubric product with these programs, as well.	Watershed Science
Think, Engage, & Apply	Having time to discuss amongst the faculty what each person was doing around assessment, and how each person conceptualized critical thinking in our area was very helpful. I think we realized that we are pretty much on the same page but that we haven't communicated our expectations consistently and clearly to our students	Human Services
Engage	<b>YES</b>	Literature
Create	Not yet. I am still trying to build momentum. The faculty who have used assessment seem to appreciate it.	Art
Communicate	At this juncture, we find our department's assessment plan effective but limited, since it has been focused on only a segment of the Speech and Communication Studies program. With our new rubric and the option of developing additional discipline rubrics, we can embark on a broader program of artifact assessment across the curriculum.	Speech and Communications
Communicate	Often in math class, both the instructor and the student are focused on the "right answer". Emphasizing the importance of communication, particularly of verbalizing thoughts in words and symbols, shifts the focus of an assessment to the problem solving process.	Math
Apply	The project did affirm and reinforce that the development of clinical problem-solving skills is a process. We can improve how we give feedback to students because we have articulated steps and have a format to show where students are in their learning and where we want them to be at a specific point in their academic progression.	Physical Therapist Assistant

**4. Will the use of this rubric, or your involvement with this project, cause you to modify your curriculum for this class or your department/program?**

CLO	Faculty Response	Discipline
Think	No. The rubric we developed for the ATeam is only a modification of one we already use—there is strong alignment already.	English 104,105,106
Think & Apply	Minor tweaks may be expected here to existing courses. Many of the Earth and Environmental Science (EES) and Watershed Science Technician (WST) program courses have recently undergone major curriculum revisions. However, several new WST program courses are undergoing curriculum design now and into the fall, and this process will be exceptionally helpful to us as we go through that exercise.	Watershed Science
Think, Engage, & Apply	As a program, we decided that we would share and discuss our rubrics with our students in each class as they related not only to assessment but also to our expectations for program graduates.	Human Services
Engage	That will depend on how the outcomes and rubric as a whole are interpreted and institutionalized within the department – but potentially <u>yes</u> .	Literature
Create	Not sure yet. Probably not this rubric, however it may affect some grading practices and more directly inform student about process rather than product.	Art
Communicate	<p>Over the past five or six years, the Speech and Communication Studies Department has developed a three-pronged assessment plan, so far applied only to its highest enrollment foundational skills classes that meet the AAOT Oral Communication requirement. The department plan includes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A. <u>Cognitive assessment</u>: pre-test and post-test of the course’s cognitive learning outcomes</li> <li>B. <u>Skills assessment</u>: normed performance assessment based on a college rubric (so far according to the “old” <i>Communicate Effectively</i> rubric)</li> <li>C. <u>Affective assessment</u>: student assessment of learning gains, as measured on the SALG survey instrument</li> </ul> <p>We believe this term’s work will be most useful in our performance assessment phase, where we can substitute “our” new rubric for the college version. Since the new rubric has been aligned with college Core Learning Outcome dimensions and aligned across our curriculum, we are connecting the college’s mission and strategic directions to student learning in our discipline.</p>	Speech and Communications
Communicate	<p>I intend to use it the next time I teach Math 20, as well as include a significant amount of writing as a part of the curriculum.</p> <p>I am not in a position to alter the curriculum of the classes offered by my department. I would be delighted to see the MTH 20 curriculum revised to meet the Common Core standards. If the department does ever decide to modify the curriculum, I would like to be involved. The rubric will not alter the way I teach the course because it is simply an articulation of outcomes I already look for. The fact that I have now organized and verbalized my thoughts will make it easier to write worksheets and tests that enable students to demonstrate to what extent they have achieved the desired outcomes.</p>	Math

Apply	We anticipate using the rubric as a means of student self-assessment at the beginning and end of their first year in our two year program. We can also connect the outcomes of the rubric to course level outcomes to improve student feedback on performance. Lastly, we will consider refining and reducing language in the rubric we created to make it more concise and easier for students to interpret.	Physical Therapist Assistant
-------	---	------------------------------